



Rincon Consultants, Inc.

301 9th Street, Suite 109
Redlands, California 92374

909 253 0705 OFFICE AND FAX

info@rinconconsultants.com
www.rinconconsultants.com

April 4, 2019
Project No: 19-07370

Steve Landis
LandexCorp LLC
Via email: steve@landexcorp.com

Subject: Historic Treatment Guidance for the Grandma Isaak Residence, 9611 Hillside Road, Rancho Cucamonga, San Bernardino County, California

Dear Mr. Landis:

This memorandum was prepared for LandexCorp LLC by Rincon Consultants, Inc. (Rincon) to provide historic treatment guidance for the property located at 9611 Hillside Road (APN 1061-571-01) in Rancho Cucamonga (subject property). The approximately 3.04-acre property includes a residence that was constructed in 1911 per city records. Known as the Grandma Isaak (or Isaac) House, it was designated a City of Rancho Cucamonga Landmark in 2000.¹

Rincon understands that LandexCorp LLC proposes to subdivide the subject property into four separate residential lots. The Grandma Isaak House would remain in place on what has been defined as Lot #4, resulting in three unimproved lots for the future development. Approximately 78 feet of an existing stone wall and steps located adjacent to and south of the extant house would also be removed. The project may also include a new, detached garage on Lot #4 as an ancillary building to the home.

Rincon further understands that subsequent to the designation of the residence as a City Landmark, a previous owner completed improvements to the residence which resulted in the removal of a number of original character-defining features. The City of Rancho Cucamonga has requested that the applicant obtain guidance from a qualified historic preservation consultant to provide treatment recommendations that will reintroduce some of the removed historic-period design elements, in an effort to evoke its original historic significance.²

Principal and Architectural History Program Manager Shannon Carmack prepared this memorandum. Ms. Carmack has over 19 years of experience in historic preservation planning and meets the Secretary of the Interior's *Professional Qualification Standards* (PQS) for architectural history and history.

¹ City of Rancho Cucamonga Planning Department, Historic Preservation, 2011. *Historic Landmarks and Points of Interest*.

² City of Rancho Cucamonga. 2019. Design Review Committee Agenda, 2 April.

Methods

The current analysis and recommendations included a review of the property's Historic Landmark Designation Application, the City of Rancho Cucamonga's list of local Historic Landmarks and Points of Interest, and two memorandums prepared by Pamela Daly of Daly & Associates in 2016 and 2018.³

Background

The City of Rancho Cucamonga's list of Historic Landmarks and Points of Interest (2011) describes the home as a "one and a half story colonial styled structure with Craftsman elements". Additional detail in the Historic Landmark Application (1987) describes features such as a high gabled roof, exposed eaves, knee braces in the gables, decorated verge board consisting of a wood arch, an exterior chimney on the west side of the home with concrete finish, brick decoration and an iron ash door, wood clapboard siding, field stone piers and wood pillars at the porch, 24"x24" concrete tile flooring at porch, concrete steps, wood-sash windows with a large central pane and transom, 32-light picture window in living room, double-hung windows at sides, wooden door with oval glass panel, board-and-batten siding on the single-story addition.

Numerous alterations have been completed since the property was designated a City Historic Landmark. Studies completed in 2016 and 2018 noted the following alterations to the residence:

- Removal of all the original windows and change of size of window openings
- Removal of all the original doors
- Removal of all the original clapboard siding from the house and the original board-and-batten siding from the attached ancillary structure
- Removal of the exposed rafter tails under the roof eaves
- Installation of inappropriate fascia boards on eaves
- Alteration to the chimney
- Inappropriate mortar work on rubble stone walls
- Inappropriate additions to the south and west facades

In 2016, Daly & Associates was contracted to evaluate the proposed project to ascertain if the project would have a significant adverse impact to the property which is considered a historical resource under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Ms. Daly concluded that the Grandma Isaak House had undergone alterations that were not compatible with the *Secretary of the Interior's Recommendations for the Treatment of Historic Properties*, and the house had lost integrity of design, materials, workmanship, setting, feeling and association. Thus, the property had lost the essential physical features that allowed it to represent a building dating from the 1910s and to the early history of Rancho Cucamonga and the area. In addition, Ms. Daly stated that notwithstanding the current condition of the house, the loss of the portion of the stone wall and steps would not be considered a substantial alteration to the property even though the wall and steps appear to date from the original period of significance of the property. In 2018,

³ Daly & Associates. 2016. Memorandum to Steve Landis, 9611 Hillside Trust, regarding Review of the development of Tentative Tract No. 20000, APN: 1061-571-01-0000, Rancho Cucamonga, San Bernardino County, 26 April.

Daly & Associates. 2018. Memorandum to Steve Landis, 9611 Hillside Trust, regarding Review of the development of Tentative Tract No. 20000, APN: 1061-571-01-0000, Rancho Cucamonga, San Bernardino County, 18 July.

Daly & Associates was again contracted to update the assessment of the home and potential impacts of the proposed project. Ms. Daly's findings remained the same as in 2016.

Findings and Recommendations

Rincon has identified several improvements that would evoke the residence's original character and architectural style, while retaining its remaining historic fabric. The following recommendations are provided to assist with this historic treatment:

- Removal of non-original fascia boards on eaves
- Replacement of primary elevation door with a Craftsman-style door
- Removal of soffit to expose rafter tails (if extant, or replace in kind)
- Replacement of knee braces in gables
- Texture or treatment to the exterior of the chimney, to evoke the covered brickwork
- Installation of a landmark designation plaque near the residence
- Installation of additional vertical landscaping elements to frame the façade and highlight the wall and porch

Rincon also understands that the project may also include a new, detached garage on Lot #4 as an ancillary building to the Grandma Isaak house. Although many Craftsman-style homes had small garages added after their original date of construction, a standard-size, contemporary two-car garage would not be appropriate or compatible with a building from that period. In the case of the subject property, such an addition would contribute to the cumulative effect of the alterations undertaken on the property and further negatively affect the property's integrity. Therefore construction of a detached garage is not recommended.

Conclusions

Rincon finds that the above-mentioned treatment recommendations would satisfy the City's Design Review Committee direction to reintroduce historic-period design elements to the property. Should you have any questions or comments regarding this memorandum, please do not hesitate to contact me at 562-676-5485, or scarmack@rinconconsultants.com

Sincerely,



Shannon Carmack, B.A.
Principal and Architectural History Program Manager
Rincon Consultants, Inc.