



BOARD MEMBERS:

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Richard Six, *Vice Chair*
David Black
Bob Cunningham
Leon A. Olson
David R. Watkins
Dennis Whelan

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Cathy Murillo

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

Roxana Bonderson

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Christina McGuire, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

City of Santa Barbara
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES
NOVEMBER 16, 2020

3:00 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically

(3:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

1. **119 E COTA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-240-017
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PRT2019-00601
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Hess, Public Works Department
Architect: Cearnal Collective

(Proposal for a new three-story, approximately 53-foot high, 65,000 square foot Police Station, and associated 37.5-foot high, 86,000 square foot parking structure to accommodate 244 parking spaces, at the existing 1.61-acre Cota Commuter Parking Lot. Each structure would also have a subterranean level. Eight additional surface parking spaces would be provided. Existing Police operations, currently located at four separate sites, would be consolidated at the new project site. Grading includes 22,000 cubic yards of export. A total of 24 Tipuana tipu trees and 6 oak trees would be removed. The existing MTD bus stop shelter on Cota Street would be relocated, along with the existing plaques commemorating the old Lincoln School. Following ABR Concept Review, the Planning Commission will conduct a public hearing to consider the required findings for a Community Benefit project to exceed 45 feet in height. Project requires Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines.

RECUSAL: To avoid any actual or perceived conflict of interest, Board Member Cunningham recused himself from hearing this item due to prior contractual obligations.

Actual time: 3:10 p.m.

Present: Brad Hess, Principal Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Courtney Jane Miller, Landscape Architect, CJM::LA ; Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:36 p.m.

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Mary Louise Days
2. Richard Closson

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt, Richard Closson, and Patricia Saley was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:42 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with comments:

1. The overall height of the project is acceptable.
2. The overall massing of the project is acceptable. The placement of the building masses is acceptable due to the nature of the program.
3. Refine the architecture to make it more palatable to the image of a Santa Barbara civic building. Provide a more traditional Spanish style and make the project more inviting to the streetscape.
4. Restudy the two-story volume at the corner of Cota and Santa Barbara Streets. Provide a solution to soften the two-story volume and make it more in line with Spanish character. The corner of the new proposed structure's size and apparent massing shall be reduced in order to relate it better to the existing neighborhood. Restudy the simplicity of the boxy design and the tile screen at the corner structure.
5. On the Cota Street elevation, study the portion of the garage especially at the lower floor, in order to make it more inviting with the human scale and less austere.

Action: Six/Olson, 5/0/1. (Watkins abstained. Cunningham absent.) Motion carried.

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Richard Six, *Vice Chair*
Lauren Anderson
David Black
Leon A. Olson
David R. Watkins
Dennis Whelan

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Cathy Murillo

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

Roxana Bonderson

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Christina McGuire, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

City of Santa Barbara

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

JANUARY 11, 2021

3:00 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically

(4:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

2. **119 E COTA ST**
Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-240-017
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PRT2019-00601
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Hess, Public Works Department
Architect: Cearnal Collective

(Proposal for a new three-story, approximately 53-foot high, 65,000 square foot Police Station, and associated 37.5-foot high, 86,000 square foot parking structure to accommodate 244 parking spaces, at the existing 1.61-acre Cota Commuter Parking Lot. Each structure would also have a subterranean level. Eight additional surface parking spaces would be provided. Existing Police operations, currently located at four separate sites, would be consolidated at the new project site. Grading includes 22,000 cubic yards of export. A total of 24 Tipuana tipu trees and 6 oak trees would be removed. The existing MTD bus stop shelter on Cota Street would be relocated, along with the existing plaques commemorating the old Lincoln School. Following ABR Concept Review, the Planning Commission will conduct a public hearing to consider the required findings for a Community Benefit project to exceed 45 feet in height. Project requires Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the Project Compatibility Analysis and the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on November 16, 2020.

Actual time: 4:16 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective; Brad Hess, Applicant, City of Santa Barbara; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect; and Kathy Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:35 p.m.

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Richard Closson
2. Patricia Saley

Written correspondence from Richard Closson and Bob Cunningham was acknowledged.

Straw Vote: With some revisions to design as presented, are the arrangements of the parts of the building acceptable? 4/1 Passed.

Public comment closed at 4:41 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Full Board with comments:

1. The Board appreciates the response from the applicant to the Board's previous comments.
2. The allay, squaring of the building, and bringing the entry closer to the street is a positive improvement.
3. The pushback of the parking garage and the landscaping is a positive improvement.
4. The progress of the project toward a more Spanish traditional architecture is moving in the right direction.
5. Provide detailing that reduces the apparent austerity of the building.
6. The architecture frontage of the Cota Street garage needs significant revisions to provide more traditional detailing, especially with the large interrupted mission tile and wider screen provided.
7. Applicant shall find ways to push the entry to the Cota Street side garage back to the setback of the third floor.
8. Applicant shall find different areas to provide solar panels, in order to eliminate the solar panel array against Cota Street.
9. Applicant shall restudy the floor plate of the third floor office portion of the building to step back portions of the third floor further from Cota Street.
10. Study different techniques to provide a more human scale, such as lowering of the sills or windows along Cota Street and Santa Barbara Street.
11. Applicant should study opportunities to bring building functions to the first floor first bay of the parking garage to provide more interest.
12. The Board is supportive for the additional height requested and is supportive of the overall building massing, besides the request for restudy to reduce some of the massing and providing a more human scale.

Action: Six/Olson, 4/1/0. (Moore opposed. Watkins and Anderson absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:50 TO 5:54 P.M. ***

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Richard Six, Vice Chair
Lauren Anderson
David Black
Leon A. Olson
David Watkins
Dennis Whelan

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Mike Jordan

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

Roxana Bonderson

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Christina McGuire, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

City of Santa Barbara

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

SPECIAL FULL BOARD

MEETING/WORK SESSION MINUTES

FEBRUARY 12, 2021

1:00 P.M. – 4:00 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically

I. CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW OF THE PROPOSED POLICE STATION

119 E COTA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-240-017
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PRT2019-00601
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Hess, Public Works Department
Architect: Cearnal Collective

(Proposal for a new three-story, approximately 53-foot high, 65,000 square foot Police Station, and associated 37.5-foot high, 86,000 square foot parking structure to accommodate 244 parking spaces, at the existing 1.61-acre Cota Commuter Parking Lot. Each structure would also have a subterranean level. Eight additional surface parking spaces would be provided. Existing Police operations, currently located at four separate sites, would be consolidated at the new project site. Grading includes 22,000 cubic yards of export. A total of 24 Tipuana tipu trees and 6 oak trees would be removed. The existing plaques commemorating the old Lincoln School would be relocated. Following ABR Concept Review, the Planning Commission will conduct a public hearing to consider the required findings for a Community Benefit project to exceed 45 feet in height. Project requires Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Applicant requests ABR comments on their compliance with the Compatibility Analysis in order to move forward to the Planning Commission for discretionary approval related to the building height exception. Project requires compliance with the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on January 11, 2021.

Actual time: 1:18 p.m.

Present: Rebecca Bjork, Assistant City Administrator; Marylinda Arroyo, Police Captain, City of Santa Barbara; Jim McClaren, Senior Principal, MWL Architects; Brad Hess, Principal Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect; Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Dan Hentschke, Assistant City Attorney; and Sarah Knecht, Assistant City Attorney, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Kennedy stated that Staff is looking for comments to the Planning commission regarding the height exception request and Project Compatibility Analysis.

Public comment opened at 2:07 p.m.,

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Richard Closson
2. Fred Sweeney
3. Anna Marie Gott

Written correspondence from Bob Cunningham, Patricia Saley, and Richard Closson was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:16 p.m.

*** THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 3:27 TO 3:30 P.M. ***

- Motion:** **Continue to the Planning Commission for return to the Full Board with comments:**
1. Given the technical issues and requirements of the building in relationship to the base-flood elevation and the functional requirements for the floor-to-floor heights, the height of the building is acceptable. It is unreasonable to ask the applicant to lower the project significantly.
 2. Although the Board is uncomfortable about the location of the entry and the amount of parking garage facing the main street, the Board understands the balance required between desirable public orientation and aesthetics, and the functional requirements of the program and the given site.
 3. The Board appreciates the positive responses of the applicant to the Board's previous comments on the architecture and appreciates the improvements to the sensitive garage elevation.
 4. The applicant shall further study breaking up, reducing, and provide a more inviting treatment to the garage elevation on Cota Street.
 5. The Board appreciates the softening of architecture and looks forward to further detailing and design features that soften it even further. In particular, provide alternate solutions to the parapet at the garage in at least a portion of the elevation on the third floor, such as providing a semi opaque material and the removal of the modern canopy over the large window to the east of the Cota Street stair tower.
 6. The Board appreciates the elimination of solar panels along the Cota Street elevation third floor garage.
 7. The Board looks forward to seeing the architectural design refined.
 8. Applicant shall work with Public Works Department on the use of the public parking areas along Santa Barbara Street.

9. At this level, the Board is comfortable about the project potentially meeting the Project Compatibility criteria as follows:
 - a. Without hearing anything contrary from Staff, the project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project. The style of the proposed architecture is a traditional Spanish style.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood. The project serves an exceptional and unique purpose.
 - d. There are no adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources or natural features.
 - e. There are no established scenic public vistas. Given the Board's understanding, both Cota Street and Santa Barbara Street views are not public view corridors.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, especially considering the upper decks and roof gardens.

Action: Six/Olson, 4/2/0. (Moore and Anderson opposed. Watkins absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:07 P.M. ***

**BOARD MEMBERS:**

Kevin Moore, *Chair*
Richard Six, *Vice Chair*
Lauren Anderson
David Black
Leon A. Olson
Dennis Whelan

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

Mike Jordan

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

Roxana Bonderson

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Christina McGuire, Assistant Planner
Mary Ternovskaya, Commission Secretary

City of Santa Barbara

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

MINUTES

APRIL 19, 2021

3:00 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically

(4:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW OF PROPOSED POLICE STATION

2. **119 E COTA ST (to be changed to 601 Santa Barbara St.)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-240-017
Zone: M-C
Application Number: PRT2019-00601
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Brad Hess, Public Works Department
Architect: Cearnal Collective

(Proposal for a new three-story, approximately 53-foot high, 65,000 square foot Police Station, and associated 37.5-foot high, 86,000 square foot parking structure to accommodate 244 parking spaces, at the existing 1.61 –acre Cota Commuter Parking Lot. Each structure would also have a subterranean level. Eight additional surface parking spaces would be provided. Existing Police operations, currently located at four separate sites, would be consolidated at the new project site. Grading includes 22,000 cubic yards of export. A total of 24 Tipuana Tipu trees and 6 oak trees would be removed. The existing plaques commemorating the old Lincoln School would be relocated onsite. On March 18, 2021, the Planning Commission approved the building height exception to allow buildings up to 60 feet in height. Project requires Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission.)

No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing. Project requires compliance with the following guidelines: Urban Design Guidelines, Infill Design Guidelines, and Outdoor Lighting Design Guidelines. Project was last reviewed on February 12, 2021.

Actual time: 4:15 p.m.

Present: Brad Hess, Principal Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Brian Cearnal, Architect, Cearnal Collective; Courtney Miller, Landscape Architect, CJMLA; Jeff Hornubckle, Cearnal Collective; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:36 p.m.,

The following individual(s) spoke:

1. Richard Closson
2. Patricia Saley

Written correspondence from Anton Hoffman, Andrew Bermant, Josie Castagnola, Jeff Wood, Joel Fithian, Paulina Conn, Paul Didier, Francesca Galt, Kate Carson, and Sam Edelman was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:41 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support studying a change of colored tone and/or texture? 6/0 Passed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support restudying the largest windows on the third and second floor areas on the east and south elevation? 4/2 Passed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members can support the tower? 4/2 Passed.

Straw vote: How many Board Members believe the hardscape and pocket park should be reduced and replaced with significantly higher planting? 2/4 Failed.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to the Planning Commission with comments:

1. The changes since the last meeting are very positive and are moving towards a very fine design. The Planning Commission's acceptance of the project's height was based on the understanding that this would be an exemplary building and the project is moving towards that. The Board looks forward to seeing refinements, especially in the Spanish tradition.
2. The addition of planting along Santa Barbara Street in the parking zone is very positive and helps mitigate the northeast position of the entry. The applicant shall study providing further landscaping structures such as sandstone pilasters or bollards in the area directly in front of the entry to enhance the identification of the entry.
3. Applicant shall study the proportions and sizes of the larger window masses on the second and third floors on the east and south elevation relative to the surrounding walls.
4. Applicant shall find opportunities to provide stone that is more integrated into the building.
5. The Board looks forward to confirmation that a bus stop will be included along Cota Street.
6. The tower as designed, with continued refinement (such as lowering the plinth to a more pedestrian scale) is acceptable and integrated with the building.
7. The landscaping, especially the hardscape around the building, shall approach a more traditional design. For example, the diagonal patterning of brick work shall be more axial.
8. The Board appreciates the improvements, and the introduction of interest and real activities at the south elevation of the garage. One Board Member suggests that the façade section of the Information Technology building be developed into more of a column and lintel expression. One Board Member feels that the parapets along the

parking garage elevation should be made heavier and more differential. One Board Member suggests the applicant provide a solution to the simple hat on the south elevation stair tower, have it penetrated by a chimney or other device to add interest.

9. Every effort should be made to find either a unique product or custom design for the garage roll up door on Cota elevation especially.
10. The majority of the Board continues to advocate that the mass, bulk, and scale simulation models and fly-by's are far superior to story poles and will not demand story poles for this project.
11. The applicant shall study the massing of the corner element to better acknowledge its importance to the site and enhance the character of pedestrian activities of the intersection.
12. The corner signage shall be relocated to avoid vandalism and better use of materials.

Action:

Six/Olson, 6/0/0. Motion carried.