



OCTOBER 6, 2022

VIA EMAIL: MANAYA@TULARE.CA.GOV

Mario Anaya, City Planner
City of Tulare
411 East Kern Avenue
Tulare, CA 93274



Dear Mr. Anaya:

NOTICE OF PREPARATION OF AN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (EIR) AND SCOPING MEETING FOR THE CHANDLER GROVE MASTER PLAN AND ANNEXATION PROJECT, SCH#2022090149

The Department of Conservation's (Department) Division of Land Resource Protection (Division) has reviewed the Notice of Preparation of an Environmental Impact Report and Scoping Meeting for the Chandler Grove Master Plan and Annexation Project (Project). The Division monitors farmland conversion on a statewide basis, provides technical assistance regarding the Williamson Act, and administers various agricultural land conservation programs. We offer the following comments and recommendations with respect to the project's potential impacts on agricultural land and resources.

Project Description

The proposed Project consists of a mixed-use development on approximately 231 acres of active agricultural land in Tulare County, CA. Approximately 10.3 acres of perimeter right-of-way would be dedicated as part of the project, leaving approximately 220 acres for development. Once developed, the proposed project site would include approximately 1,197 total units of low, medium, and high-density residential (163.1 acres), a central park (14.1 acres), a neighborhood commercial center (10.8 acres), a school (4.9 acres), and a community center (0.78 acres). The housing would include approximately 364 units of low-density single-family units, 281 units of medium density single family units and townhomes, and 552 high density apartments.

The project site is currently located within unincorporated Tulare County (County) but is planned to be annexed to the City of Tulare (City) as part of the project. The project site is comprised of four separate parcels and includes Assessor's Parcel Numbers [APNs] 184-050-007, 184-050-034, 184-050-035, and 184-050-010. The project site is bound by South Oakmore Street (Road 124) to the west, the East Tulare Villa community to the east, Avenue 228 to the north, and E Bardsley Ave to the south.

Department Comments

The conversion of agricultural land represents a permanent reduction and significant impact to California's agricultural land resources. CEQA requires that all feasible and reasonable mitigation be reviewed and applied to projects. Under CEQA, a lead agency should not approve a project if there are feasible alternatives or feasible mitigation measures available that would lessen the significant effects of the project.

All mitigation measures that are potentially feasible should be included in the project's environmental review. A measure brought to the attention of the lead agency should not be left out unless it is infeasible based on its elements.

Consistent with CEQA Guidelines, the Department recommends the County consider agricultural conservation easements, among other measures, as potential mitigation. (See Cal. Code Regs., tit. 14, § 15370 [mitigation includes "compensating for the impact by replacing or providing substitute resources or environments, including through permanent protection of such resources in the form of conservation easements."])

Mitigation through agricultural easements can take at least two forms: the outright purchase of easements or the donation of mitigation fees to a local, regional, or statewide organization or agency whose purpose includes the acquisition and stewardship of agricultural easements. The conversion of agricultural land should be deemed an impact of at least regional significance. Hence, the search for replacement lands should not be limited strictly to lands within the project's surrounding area.

A helpful source for regional and statewide agricultural mitigation banks is the California Council of Land Trusts. They provide helpful insight into farmland mitigation policies and implementation strategies, including a guidebook with model policies and a model local ordinance. The guidebook can be found at:

[California Council of Land Trusts](#)

Of course, the use of conservation easements is only one form of mitigation that should be considered. Any other feasible mitigation measures should also be considered. Indeed, the recent judicial opinion in *King and Gardiner Farms, LLC v. County of Kern* (2020) 45 Cal.App.5th 814 ("KG Farms") holds that agricultural conservation easements on a 1 to 1 ratio are not alone sufficient to adequately mitigate a project's conversion of agricultural land. KG Farms does not stand for the proposition that agricultural conservation easements are irrelevant as mitigation. Rather, the holding suggests that to the extent they are considered, they may need to be applied at a greater than 1 to 1 ratio, or combined with other forms of mitigation (such as restoration of some land not currently used as farmland).

Conclusion

The Department recommends further discussion of the following issues:

- Type, amount, and location of farmland conversion resulting directly and indirectly from implementation of the proposed project.
- Impacts on any current and future agricultural operations in the vicinity, e.g., land-use conflicts, increases in land values and taxes, loss of agricultural support infrastructure such as processing facilities, etc.
- Incremental impacts leading to cumulative impacts on agricultural land. This would include impacts from the proposed project, as well as impacts from past, current, and likely future projects.
- Proposed mitigation measures for all impacted agricultural lands within the proposed project area.
- Projects compatibility with lands within an agricultural preserve and/or enrolled in a Williamson Act contract.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to comment on the Notice of Preparation of an Environmental Impact Report and Scoping Meeting for the Chandler Grove Master Plan and Annexation Project. Please provide this Department with notices of any future hearing dates as well as any staff reports pertaining to this project. If you have any questions regarding our comments, please contact Farl Grundy, Associate Environmental Planner via email at Farl.Grundy@conservation.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Monique Wilber

Monique Wilber
Conservation Program Support Supervisor