

# Exhibit B-2



NORTHWEST BIOSURVEY  
Environmental & Planning Services  
1905 Westlake Drive, Kelseyville CA 95451  
Phone (707) 889-1061  
nwbio98@gmail.com

September 13, 2021

Sarah Pistone, CPESC #9225  
HDVine LLC  
PO Box 1686  
Middletown, CA 95461  
C: 707-533-3511  
[sarah@HDVine.com](mailto:sarah@HDVine.com)

**RE: Response to Napa County Review Letter for Liao Family Vineyard Project Biological Resource Assessment, Dated March 15, 2021**

Dear Ms. Pistone,

As per your request, I am providing this response to Napa County review comments on the above-referenced biological resource assessment. The review questions are provided below:

**Comment a.i.:**

*"Provide additional information and details on any significant trees (i.e. Trees with Unique Wildlife Value) within the project area and ecological benefits they may provide. While one tree was identified as a bat habitat tree, based on the site inspection there appears (sic) to be other tress (sic) within the project area that may provide wildlife value."*

**Response:**

The wildlife value of trees within the woodlands of the Liao property are discussed in several places in the report. While a single tree with particular potential to serve as bat habitat is mapped, each of the trees - both individually, and more importantly, as a functioning woodland - provide wildlife value. As stated in Section 4.4 – "Wildlife Assessment" the second paragraph under bats:

*"The denser woodlands on the property have the potential to contain excellent habitat for pallid bats, including the numerous decadent oaks within the grassland and the proximity to agricultural ponds. Although no bat sign was seen at the time of the visits, trees proposed for removal should be surveyed for the presence of bats prior to disturbance."*

Due to the fact that wildlife are mobile, and their presence can be seasonal, species-specific surveys are a standard recommendation prior to tree removal during their nesting or roosting seasons. The potential for the presence of both bats and birds is noted in the report.

Please see:

- Section 4.4 "Wildlife Assessment", particularly the second paragraph under bats
- Section 6.3 "Wildlife Value of Woodlands in the Survey Area – Core Habitat Values"
- Section 8.2 "Potential Impacts and Proposed Mitigation for Biological Resources"
- Section 8.2 Mitigation Measures 3&4

The "numerous decadent oaks" with a potential to serve as bat habitat are not individually mapped because all trees within the proposed vineyard block with a potential to serve as bird or bat habitat will need to be surveyed within 14 days prior to tree removal if this occurs during their roosting season. This same requirement pertains to raptors and other birds with protected status during their breeding season. As noted above, no bat sign (current or historic) was observed during the survey; however, this does not mean that bats or nesting birds will not be present at the time of project construction.

**Comment a.ii:**

*"An identification and discussion of any special-status mosses, bryophytes, and lichens known to occur in the area, as identified in the California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDDB), including a listing of mosses, bryophytes and lichens occurring or that may occur in the project area."*

**Response:**

Please review **TABLE 3: CNDDDB Sensitive Plant and Wildlife Species Within the Mt. George, California 7½' Quadrangle**. This table lists all of the sensitive plants listed in the CNDDDB within the project area. No non-vascular plants are listed within the quadrangle.

Please also see Section 5.1 "Botanical Survey Results" – first paragraph, which states:

*"A total of 88 native and introduced plant taxa including non-vascular plants were identified. No sensitive plant taxa were found."*

Please note that the term "non-vascular plants" pertains to mosses, bryophytes, and lichens.

Response Prepared by:



Steve Zalusky

Principal Biologist